

## BOXBOROUGH FIRE STATION - SITE SELECTION MATRIX - ROUND 2

Date: 3/13/24 FSBC Meeting

Vertex and Context Scoring

				502 Mass Ave			72 Stow Road		
				New Bldg	Weighted Score	Notes	New Bldg	Weighted Score	Notes
Evaluation Round 2				Score 1-5			Score 1-5		
1	Well Water	Available.	5	5	25	Well water already onsite from Hager Well	3	15	Assumed existing wells for existing structure but inadequate for FS. New wells needed. See Exhibit 1 - preliminary plan from HKT study.
2	Percolation Test for septic	Adequate percolation for new septic system.	10	2	20	See Exhibit 2 - Samiotes Test Pit report dated 1/10/25 page 1 - High water table. Perc test scheduled for 3/14.	5	50	See Exhibit 2 - Samiotes Test Pit report dated 1/10/25 page 2. Perc test scheduled for 3/14.
3	Geotech Survey - Borings	Condition of existing soil and capacity to support new structure.	7	5	35	See Exhibit 3 - McPhail Geotechnical Memo report on 502 Mas Ave, page 4 for positive soil results to bear foundations. More "robust" groundwater control required per page 6	5	35	See Exhibit 3 - McPhail Geotechnical Memo report on 72 Stow, page 4 for positive soil results to bear foundations.
4	Response Time	Relationship between the location of the proposed site and the ability to dispatch from the facility to all parts of Town. Based of traffic study results.	10	5	50	Existing station proven response time. Chappell Engineering Associates - Traffic Impact and Access Study - See Exhibit 4 page 10 and 11 of 502 report.	4	40	0.9 minutes longer to properties east of 72. Chappell Engineering Associates - Traffic Impact and Access Study - See Exhibit 4 page 10 and 11 of 72 report.
5	Supports FD program	Delivers the type, quantity, size, layout of spaces as well as the site features, required by the program.	10	3	30	Due to restrictions on buildable footprint the App Bay is 7' lower than 1st floor Admin level and there a less parking spaces for FD (shared parking with PD). See Exhibit 5 for Context conceptual floor and site plans Exhibit 5	5	50	Admin/public areas all on 1st floor. See Context conceptual floor plans Exhibit 5
6	Abutter Impact - FS Operations	Project impacts direct abutters and/or neighborhood permanently due to fire station 24/7 operations. Mitigation measures included in design.	9	4	36	Impacts future expansion of Police Department. See Exhibit 6	4	36	Noise and lights per neighboring residents. See Exhibit 6. Mitigation to be included in design. Also prevents high density multi-story affordable multi-family housing being built.
7	Conceptual Estimated Total Cost	Overall project cost (including hard costs, soft costs, contingencies).	10	1	10	See Exhibit 7. Total estimated cost at Conceptual Phase is \$39.7M. Construction duration 24.5 months due to construction of temp facilities.	5	50	See Exhibit 7. Total estimated cost at Conceptual Phase is \$33.6M. Construction duration 19 months.
8	Wetlands/Survey	Confirmed location of wetlands or bodies of water; and impacts to building location on site.	8	2	16	Wetlands encroach onto site. 1/22 ConCom meeting established delineation per Samiotes ANRAD plan. See Exhibit #8 for plan and Places letter	5	40	Small Area of wetlands buffer in NW corner of parcel. Apron exit drive designed to avoid if required. See Exhibit 8 for plan
9	Traffic Study/Vehicle Access/Sight Lines/Safety	Impact on the operation of the facility by any known traffic issues from adjacent streets and neighborhood; ability of vehicles to enter or leave the site; ease of maneuverability within the site. Consultant study.	8	5	40	Chappell Engineering Associates - Traffic Impact and Access Study - See Exhibit 9 page 18 and 19 of the 502 report.	5	40	Chappell Engineering Associates - Traffic Impact and Access Study - See Exhibit 9 page 18 and 19 of the 72 report. Trees and stone wall (Scenic) to be addressed.
10	Sustainability	Based on criteria from third party organizations. Site related only.	8	2	16	See Exhibit 10 comparison spreadsheet based on USGBC and LEED definitions which shows less sustainable items than 72.	4	32	See Exhibit 10 comparison spreadsheet based on USGBC and LEED definitions which shows more sustainable items than 502.
11	Special Site Conditions	Site costs above and beyond basic foundation prep; parking lots and exterior improvements (e.g., additional clearing; grading; ledge; archaeology; added site scope (e.g., paving, sidewalks); off-site work (e.g., signals)).	5	3	15	See Exhibit 11 spreadsheet - high groundwater, excess dewatering, MassDOT requirements unknown	4	20	See Exhibit 11 spreadsheet - scenic stone wall

12	<b>Zoning</b>	Existing or potential conflicts with community zoning regulations. Setbacks.	5	1	5	Need to merge FD and PD properties. Current zoning language needs to be changed at Town Meeting. No municipal building can be built anywhere in Boxborough. Town Counsel input.	1	5	Current zoning language needs to be changed at Town Meeting. No municipal building can be built anywhere in Boxborough. Town Counsel input. In addition the current Ag/Res zoning does not exclude governmental use.
13	<b>Abutter Impact - Construction</b>	Project impacts direct abutters and/or neighborhood during construction.	5	4	20	Impact to PD and possibly school during construction. See Exhibit 13 spreadsheet.	3	15	Impact to Stow Road residents during construction. See Exhibit 13 spreadsheet.
14	<b>Communications</b>	Relationship to existing communications systems including site elevation and potential need to build communications tower.	2	5	10	Radio communication existing	4	8	Onsite radio field test performed by BFD. Clear signal.
			102	47	328		57	436	

1	Lowest Score/Worst
2	
3	
4	
5	Highest Score/Best